SOME RECENT LITERATURE ON MISSIONARY STUDIES

by A. F. WALLS

MR. WALLS describes this as "a chastened version of a paper given at a study group of the Evangelical Fellowship for Missionary Studies, Cambridge, September 1968". He adds that opinions expressed in papers presented to meetings of the groups are those of the authors, and not necessarily of the Fellowship. We congratulate Mr. Walls on his recent translation from a lectureship in the Department of Church History at Aberdeen to the headship of that University's newly constituted Department of Religious Studies (which has replaced the former Department of Biblical Study).

"A LIBRARY" said Victor Hugo, "is an act of faith", and ever since at a tender age I opened my first volume of Everyman's Library, I have wondered what that was supposed to mean. However, it has this much to be said for it as the heading of a literature survey that, when we begin to survey or collect literature —which is essentially what library building is—be it on missionary studies or anything else, we know not where it will lead us, save that it will probably be a long way. Like the archetypal man of faith, we go out, not knowing whither we go.

But if we have pledged ourselves to missionary studies we have entered a subject touching upon the whole of divine revelation, which is the subject of mission, and upon the whole of the inhabited world, which is its object; one which requires the use of every scholarly discipline employed in the study of divinity and humanity. We cannot therefore be surprised if we have rather a lot to read. ("Sir", said Dr. Johnson, "do *you* read books *through*?") What follows is not a *survey* of recent literature. I have given an arbitrary meaning to the words "recent", "literature", "missions" and "survey". "Recent", I have interpreted as meaning "within the last three years", i.e. nothing published before 1965, but plenty published since. "Literature" I have restricted to books—thus excluding many items of major importance and great interest which have appeared in the various journals. I have further restricted the list to books in English, thus depriving it of items of such importance as Dr. Raymond Panikkar's *Kerygma und Indien:* a sad omission, since Dr. Panikkar has provoked much discussion, and his best-known work in English, *The Unknown Christ of Hinduism,* appeared in 1964 and must be

excluded on grounds of date. "Missionary" I have taken fairly strictly, with a very few exceptions, to relate directly to Christian presence and proclamation without the Western World, thus excluding both much literature on mission in contemporary secular society (which usually means the post-Christian west), and many studies which relate to, but do not centre on, Christian activity in various parts of the world. And as for "survey"—I have simply taken forty books—not my forty best books, or anybody's forty best books or anything like that—but just a small sample of what has come off the presses in the last three years. It is not even a random sample: it has too much history and too little theology for that, and a high proportion of the examples have deliberately been chosen from West Africa, leaving much of the rest of the world unrepresented.

This then, is only the merest fraction of the relevant literature: it can be argued, however, that each item has some significance, and should be taken into account.

Let us begin, then, with the books about books: with some bibliographies. Bibliographers have been called the magpies of the academic world: they rob the nests of others for their subsistence. It can be urged, however, that there is much to be said for an intelligent magpie, and that the selective acquisition and arrangement of other people's goods requires much patience and some talent. There is, after all, no trade in which shoddy workmanship is less forgivable than that of burglary. And much patience and some talent are certainly displayed in the manufacture of some of the bibliographies which have appeared in our own field. Professor Gerald Anderson's listing of twentieth-century works on the theology of mission[3] has now attained the dignity of a third edition and has notched 1,500 items on the Biblical basis of mission, the history of missionary thought, Christianity and other faiths, and the theory of missions. One useful feature (though it is, of course, already out of date) is the listing of the various reports of assemblies, consultations and conferences, not only of the World Council of Churches but of many other bodies of various colours. If, as Bacon hath it, reading maketh a full man, reading everything in Professor Anderson's list is likely to induce agonies of indigestion, for there is a strikingly large proportion of carbohydrate; but it is good to have so comprehensive a menu card.

Two other items in our list are guides to literature on specific areas: Professor Anderson has compiled an annotated bibliography of material in Western languages on South-East Asia,[4] in which

he has included Ceylon; and Mr. J. H. Sinclair has done similarly for Latin America.[32] It is now proposed that these be the first items in a series to cover the whole world. The lists, though comprehensive, are not, of course, complete: but it is safe to say that any missionary library and anyone seriously concerned with these areas ought to have these tools of their trade.

The three bibliographies mentioned are primarily works of patience, the next is one of talent: *A Bibliography of Modern African Religious Movements,* compiled by one scholar based in U.S.A., one in Britain and one in Germany—it is almost impossible these days to make a comprehensive bibliography without international co-operation. It is a highly intelligent bibliography which presupposes some intelligence on the part of its users. What, after all, do we want in a bibliography? First, we want to know precisely on what principles its selection is based: the compilers here enunciate their principles with admirable clarity; and very good principles they are. They have none of the academic rigidity which would exclude popular works, ephemeral magazines, or newspaper articles from consideration; and they do not interfere in the specialist's business of making judgments on the material. The second thing we want is comprehensiveness within those limits: and it is clear that the libraries of many lands have been ransacked, and that the compilers have compassed sea and land to make one entry. Next, we want accuracy: the bibliographer's job is to help us find things; he has no right to send us off on a wild goose chase for things he has not seen but has only copied from a reference somewhere else, or with mangled or incomplete data that no reader can track unaided. Scholarly literature is all too frequently marred by bogus or inadequate references; and it may be worth recalling that old axiom of textual criticism that community of error implies community of origin. From tests of this sort, the bibliography emerges very well. Not that it is inerrant—there are plenty of slips of the sort which suggest that at some point the proof was in the pudding; but in the more important matters of basic honesty and toil at verification it rings true. Next, we want good arrangement—no sane person can cope with 1,500 entries tabulated in alphabetical order—and this requires real knowledge of the subject, and of the literature, for the titles may be quite misleading. Further, it must not conflict with the next thing we want, which is cohesion: not every item belongs solely to one category of a bibliography, or can be looked at from only one point of view: and the bibliographer's job is to help as many different enquirers as he can: there should thus be a coherent

system of cross-reference and a thread of continuity throughout. Again this bibliography shows threads used rather delicately for both joining and separating items (there is more than a touch of the cement-mixer about some other bibliographies). Finally, we want good indices—and these we have here too.

This pontifical digression about bibliographies in general may be justified because in missionary studies, as a less established discipline than many, we have so much toolmaking to do. As to the subject matter of this particular bibliography, modern African religious movements, the compilers deal with a wide range of these phenomena, from all parts of non-Islamic Africa. Especially prominent are those multiform manifestations together involving many hundred of thousands of Africans who profess and call themselves Christian, which Western writers have variously designated messianic or syncretistic movements, separatist sects or cults, or independent churches. They have, in fact been called too many things, with too little attention paid to their individual features; and we must therefore give a special welcome to studies which show the life and thought of these churches in action.

There have been two notable studies of particular African independent churches: Dr. G. C. Oosthuizen's monograph on the hymnal of the Zulu Church of the Nazarites, the Shembe Church;[27] and Dr. H. W. Turner's vast work on the African Church of the Lord (Aladura).[87] They come to very different conclusions: Oosthuizen finds a syncretistic movement that has indeed broken from the traditional Zulu thought world at several key points, but which remains ambiguous or positively defective at the central point of its confession concerning Christ; Turner finds a genuinely Christian church grasping some key Biblical concepts and relating them to traditional society in perhaps the only way that men of the twilight culture of large African towns can take. This difference may, of course, simply be due to the fact that they are very different churches; but one senses also differences arising from method and approach. Dr. Oosthuizen, who belongs to a church —the Dutch Reformed Church—with a highly articulated confessional theology, is essentially literary in his approach: he takes the Church's basic text, its hymn book, analyses it, and relates it to features in the life and utterances of the Church and its members known to him. One could, of course, pick up a varied collection of ideas about any church's beliefs by quizzing any congregation, and an outsider may wonder whether, even on his own evidence, Shembe's hymns mean all that Dr. Oosthuizen says they mean. Doubtless they would had they been composed by

Dutch theologians, and they would be heretical; but the compilers are *not* Dutch theologians—and some of the material adduced by H.-J. Becken (such as the sermon of Shembe II translated in *Journal of Religion in Africa* 1 (2) 1967), suggests that they may be more Christian, if not more Chalcedonian, than Dr. Oosthuizen allows.

Dr. Turner, on the other hand, has approached the Church of the Lord (Aladura) from the point of view of a fellow-worshipper, participating so far as opportunity allowed in the life of the Church, and finding the ring of Biblical authenticity as he did so. In his second volume he gives a full and vivid account of the life and worship of one of the largest of the West African independent churches. The first volume is devoted to its history: and deserves to be known and read of all men, and not just specialists. Particularly striking is the first section depicting the emergence of the various prophet-healing churches in Western Nigeria in the 1920s and 1930s among respectable Yoruba Anglicans, against the background of the 1918 influenza epidemic (which closed churches—and what is the good of churches that close when you need them most?) and the depression: a story not, as so often assumed, of easy-going adherents who did not like church discipline, but of companies of praying people who hungered and thirsted after righteousness in their own fashion, and sought a break from the traditional world of magic (and what was quinine but the white man's substitute?). How the movement threw up charismatic leaders of remarkable stature; how and why it fell foul of the colonial government; how it entered into a love/hate relationship with American and British Pentecostals, though constantly shocked by their worldliness, makes a peculiarly thought-provoking piece of modern church history.

Between them, Dr. Oosthuizen and Dr. Turner show how important it is to deal with any group of people claiming the name of Christ *seriously*. Contrary to common assumptions, they show that such movements as the Nazaretha Church and the Aladura churches are not simply the ebullitions of enthusiasm, ignorance, nationalism or charlatanry (though some may exhibit any or all of these), but have theological, liturgical and spiritual patterns which relate to a genuine religious "ache" felt in African society. (And that these issues are not confined to Africa is shown by another impressive book, A. R. Tippett's *Solomon Islands Christianity*,[36] a production of the Institute of Church Growth, which reflects the great trouble taken by its author to understand all sorts of manifestations in a Christian community

and the reasons for them.) Dr. Oosthuizen's book prompts the reflection that African religious movements are not static, any more than are Western religious movements; they form, re-form, divide; they may become more fully Christian, or less. Dr. Turner's book prompts another—whether some of these movements which Westerners think of as syncretistic, are in fact not more radical than the older churches: whether they do not stand in a similar relationship to them to that in which the anabaptists and other radicals (whose ancestry some of us are proud to own) stood to the Reformed tradition. Certainly, while often softer on polygamy and other matters of sexual mores than the official code of the older churches, they are often far more radical in practice on fetish, the use of charms, and witchcraft—and which, in African society, is the first call for Christians—that they have no other wives but one, or that they curse not a brother lest he die?

These questions become of even more importance in the light of the thesis of Dr. David Barrett of the Research Unit of the Church of the Province of East Africa. He provides an outline in his paper in Professor Baëta's symposium,[7] and his book has now appeared under the title *Schism and Renewal*.[8] Dr. Barrett commenced his academic career in engineering, and as Parkinson's Law requires, the engineers have now followed the mathematicians into theology, bearing their computers with them. From a mass of data assembled from all over Africa, Dr. Barrett believes that it is possible to find patterns in the emergence of independent churches, and to see a relationship between their emergence and the concomitance of a number of other factors—the date of the establishment of Christianity among a particular African people, the extent of its profession, the local importance of the ancestor cult, the prevalence of polygamy, the proportion of foreign missionaries to national ministers, and the length of time in which the Bible has been available in the vernacular. He would go further and claim that, like those crime computers which can have a policeman on the spot before the murder takes place, it is possible to predict from a sufficient concomitance of positive factors, the likelihood of an independent church movement emerging. On his rating the Tiv church, which is one of the fastest-growing churches in Africa, must be due for a schism any time at all: though I am not sure whether, even if this intelligence is true, anything constructive could be done about it. One may warn a motorist to beware of low-flying aircraft, but this is bootless unless the low-flying aircraft beware of him. One thing which rather worries a non-statistician about Dr. Barrett's thesis is the

diversity of the phenomena he lumps together as independent movements. However, a specialist journal hopes to present a debate on the thesis between Dr. Barrett and another sociologist of religion, Professor Robert C. Mitchell of Swarthmore College, and it may be well to wait while the two of them punch it out—on their computer cards of course.

Meanwhile, whatever the need for macroanalysis of religious phenomena, it is vain without accurate microanalysis such as only detailed knowledge of an area can provide. A striking example of what can be done by real knowledge and without vast financial outlay is the mimeograph report on the Abak area undertaken by the Uyo Inter-Church Study group under the leadership of an American Mennonite missionary, Rev. E. I. Weaver,[40] which discovered 259 churches within a five-mile radius of this small Ibibio township and traced the origin and history of 81 of them. Alas, the area has since become a desolated battlefield; but the survey provides more useful information on Ibibio Christianity than many more pretentious articles might, and one hopes it will be imitated.

Three years ago the International African Institute devoted one of its international seminars to *Christianity in Tropical Africa*, and Professor Baëta of Ghana has now edited its proceedings.[7] As he says in his preface, "The Christian presence has been and remains, in the African scene, a massive and unavoidable fact and factor". Perhaps nowadays one ought to add that Africa, as the scene of the most striking Christian expansion for several centuries, is a massive and unavoidable factor in the history of Christianity, and should be studied, as mediaeval and Reformation Europe is studied, as a theatre of Church history. This particular volume, however, is neither a macro-study nor a series of micro-studies, but simply a collection of essays. There are some rare good things if one has the patience to poke about the shelves and the agility to climb over the crowded furniture. It is a fascinating old curiosity shop; but we could really do with a supermarket.

After a long time without any serious study of Christianity in Ghana, we have now been presented with three in three years. The most comprehensive service is offered by Dr. Hans Debrunner, who seeks to cover the whole history of Christianity in Ghana,[13] and does so with his customary bland mixture of erudition and eccentricity. These qualities are, of course, not necessarily incompatible; but I have a feeling that, as with his book on witchcraft, Dr. Debrunner's eccentricity sometimes prevents our getting the full profit from his erudition, while the

weight of his erudition hinders our getting the full entertainment value of his eccentricity. Nevertheless, he has assembled in his big book a vast store of information not easily available elsewhere, and a most interesting collection of pictures. Missionaries loom rather large, and Dr. Debrunner, like many of his Basel predecessors, is not very tender of the subfusc charismatics—Harris, Oppong, Swatson and the rest—through whom, after all, directly or indirectly a very large proportion of modern Ghanaians became Christians. Mr. Bartels, a distinguished Ghanaian educationist[9] and Dr. Noel Smith, a former missionary,[33] provide competent denominational histories of Methodism and Presbyterianism in particular: so competent, in fact, that Ghanaian Methodists and Presbyterians are now probably better served, as far as a good, modern, readable standard volume is concerned, than are their British counterparts. Mr. Bartels makes good use of the high colour which his ebullient *dramatis personae*—T. B. Freeman, Denis Kemp, Caseley Hayford, John Mensah Sarbah—Oh what parts to tear a cat in!—allow him to use. But he is himself remarkably fair and temperate in his assessments, and has a sympathetic understanding of missionary and local points of view. One can see the exact point at which he has been knocked amidships by the 50-year rule, and from that point Methodism in his narrative becomes increasingly hard to distinguish from education; but one recent commentator has made this a criticism of Ghanaian Methodism in the same period.

Dr. Noel Smith pays more attention that Mr. Bartels to the impact of Christianity on traditional society; and he is thought-provoking, though some may think unnecessarily pessimistic, on the extent to which Christianity has made itself at home in African society. For further analysis, in social and political terms, of the impact of Christianity on African communities we are fortunate in possessing two works of the first importance by Nigerian scholars: Professor J. F. Ade Ajayi's *Christian missions in Nigeria: the making of an élite*[1] and Dr. E. A. Ayandele's *The missionary impact on modern Nigeria*.[6] The titles speak for themselves: neither is a church history in the sense of being concerned with the church as a worshipping, witnessing, sinning and repenting community; they are studies of what missions did to African, and especially Yoruba, society within the period 1841-1914. Both write from the standpoint of friendly critics: they are, Dr. Ayandele especially, always trenchant and sometimes merciless, but both have been brought up within the Nigerian Christian heritage, and neither can commit the sin of Ham. Professor Ajayi depicts the

advent of Christianity to Yorubaland at the very time when the conviction is developing among British humanitarians that the development of legitimate commerce can strangle the slave trade, and Evangelicals have attained a position of influence in the establishment never attained before or since. No one doubts that the interests of Christianity and commerce lie in the same direction: and before long a missionary society whose rules firmly lay down that its agents must avoid all involvement in the political affairs of the nations where they live, finds itself unavoidably, by its very presence, up to the hilt in Yoruba politics, in national and even international politics. More embarrassing still, it finds its missionaries so identified with the interests of the different peoples where they work that when those interests clash, the missionaries clash also. Professor Ajayi has two heroes: Henry Venn, the Secretary of the Church Missionary Society, the enunciator of the principle of self-governing, self-supporting, self-propagating churches as the objective of mission, and Samuel Adjai Crowther, "the Black Bishop", who embodies that policy. Venn is his epic hero, for his theme is the making of the westernized, literary educated élite which has led West Africa to independence: and he relates its creation to C.M.S. policy as articulated by Venn. Crowther is his tragic hero. The villain is the C.M.S. of the later part of the century, which he portrays as inhaling an imperialism alien to the commercially minded humanitarianism of the 40's and 50's, imbibing ideas of racial superiority, reneguing on Venn's three-self policy, and setting mission work firmly under white direction, in the process causing Crowther to die broken-hearted, provoking schism which only the magnanimity of James Johnson, Crowther's heir apparent, kept to moderate proportions, and setting the clock back a generation in African responsibility for their own affairs. Possibly Professor Ajayi has told the story of the unhappy 80's and 90's rather too starkly in racial terms: the factors involved are more complex. A look at C.M.S. recruitment in the later part of the nineteenth century shows a falling off in the supply of godly artisans and pious Germans who had formed the staple missionary material from the beginning, followed by a surging up of the new missionary movement in the universities under quite new spiritual impulses. The young men who arrived on the Niger in the 80's and 90's via Marlborough, King's and Keswick were a new breed of missionary, with a social and spiritual outlook and expectations not seen before on the field. Church historians must be shamed that the political and social historians are setting the pace in their own field: and it is evident that their own peculiar contribution

must be made if the full complexity of the political and social picture is to be shown. Missionary strategists may have the sobering reflection that there is no success—not even a stream of devoted new recruits—that does not bring its own troubles, and the still deeper encouragement that the Lord God Omnipotent reigneth, even when recruitment dries up. Had it not been for the First World War, the churches of Africa and Asia might have been smothered by the sheer number and zeal of their missionaries.

Among Dr. Ayandele's interests are the factors which may have influenced particular persons or groups towards the acceptance of Christianity. One does not have to be a Marxist to recognize that many factors do enter into this decision: every mass movement, past or present, reflects this. It is as if God sometimes removes the blocks which appear to prevent a person or group from hearing the Gospel, or at least from considering response to it an open option. Was the Italian occupation of Ethiopia, and the consequent resistance, for instance, a factor in the remarkable story told by Dr. R. J. Davis in *Fire on the Mountains*?[12] The Sudan Interior Mission began to work among the pagan Wollāmo people, but found it hard, slow going. There were less than 50 Wollāmo Christians when the missionaries were forced out by the occupation and one might have expected a quiet snuffing out of the work. However, when the missionaries returned, there were 10,000 Wollāmo Christians.

One book in our list is directly concerned with Islam, that apparently insuperable remover of options, Miss Sonia Graham's study of government and mission education in Northern Nigeria.[14] It is good to have her unravelling of a complex story, and her high-lighting of the personalities of the great C.M.S. missionary W. R. S. Miller and the mysterious Hanns Vischer who resigned from C.M.S. to direct government education. One is left with no reason to doubt the assertion that colonial rule did more to strengthen Islam in Nigeria than all the jihads.

A work quite different from any so far mentioned, is Chief Omo Amu's account of Christianity in the Nigerian Mid-Coast.[2] This is not a work of sophisticated scholarship: the author is a busy ruling chief. It is this which gives it particular value as a representative work. It is firmly anti-colonial in tone: it delights in anecdotes of British District Officers who behaved badly and got struck by lightning, and serve them right. It is sharp on the subject of Europeans altogether, and not over-fond of missionaries. And yet it is devoted to showing how Christianity rose to its position of being taken for granted, and how "our fellow-brothers"—Sierra

Leoneans, Yorubas, but especially Mid-Westeners—laboured and eventually triumphed in the Gospel. Indeed the sort of British officer who comes to a sticky end is the sort who impounds "our" church bell. This demonstrates one of the vital features of present-day Africa—that the rejection of the west and of colonialism has not in itself involved the rejection of Christianity, which has for many peoples become "our" religion.

Secular-minded Europeans sometimes find this difficult to understand: but it runs through a great deal of Robert W. July's helpful guide to the history of (West) African thought.[22] Christianity was a vital factor in the thinking of almost all the major African political theorists of the nineteenth century—J. A. B. Horton, Bishop James Johnson, and the Great Panjandrum himself, E. W. Blyden. And how valuable is his book in dispelling the pervasive idea that articulate African political thought is a new phenomenon arising only in our own generation.

An interesting comment on Chief Omo Amu's remarks about Africans as the missionaries of Africa comes from a historian of African linguistics, Dr. Paul Hair.[17] He makes quite clear first, that the effective early study of Nigerian languages was almost entirely of missionary inspiration and execution and second that, to a much greater degree than had been generally realized, it was literate African missionaries who made many of the most substantial contributions.

But what of today? One of a series sponsored by the Institute of Church Growth seeks to relate the history of Christianity in Central and Southern Nigeria to the immediate future prospects of the Church.[18] It is an attempt well worth making, and an admirable example of the practical value of missionary studies. Unfortunately the seond half, on Southern Nigeria, is vitiated by hasty and inadequate coverage, and far too many errors of fact and allusion. Research to be of practical value must be thorough.

Despite the many studies of the social effects of 'missions', there is strangely little attention to one of the most radical effects of large-scale adhesion to Christianity, whatever the degree of personal commitment involved. Most traditional societies are what van Leeuwen has taught us to call 'ontocratic': that is, throne and altar are closely identified, kingship is hedged by divinity. An immediate effect of the adoption of Christianity is the secularization of the traditional functions of rulers and elders: a separation of powers. An account of this secularization process within one fairly small people, the Tiriki of Kenya, is provided by a sociologist,

Walter H. Sangree.[31] There is room for reflection here whether Christianity has not, by giving a rational basis for this secularization, made modern statehood more viable in Africa than it would otherwise have been.

So far, it seems, students of African society are more conscious of the complexity of changes brought about by Christian action and influence than are students of Asia. At any rate, E. D. Potts' thorough study of the Serampore Baptists and their work,[29] seems slightly old-fashioned at this point, and the title of Olav Hodne's study of L. O. Skrefsrud,[20] the converted Norwegian jailbird who spent his life with the Santal people, *"Missionary and Social Reformer"*, would get a horse-laugh in most concourses of Africanists. Yet how good it is to have such full studies as these. Again we must lament that it has taken a secular historian to write a scholarly monograph on Serampore, and again we must add that he has not done all the Church historian's work for him. And as for the Scandinavian faculties, which encourage such studies as those of Dr. Hodne and Dr. Hallencreutz,[18] and the publishers which produce them, we can only reverently uncover our heads and say, would it were so with us.

Most of the remaining books in the list are sufficiently familiar to be treated with a bare reminder of their existence. This is the case with Canon Max Warren's two volumes on the missionary movement and its social background.[38, 39] These are packed with good things and quotable bits; and they are both imaginative and courageous in their sympathetic interpretation, in their proper context, of the sort of missionary statements which now fill us with embarrassment. Christians may have shared the prejudices and misconceptions of their times—strange if it were otherwise—but there is that in the Gospel, and thus in those on whom it lays hold, which modifies, softens, transcends or even shatters human narrownesses. The main trouble with the books is that, despite the fact that the topics are crying aloud for extended treatment by someone who really understands the missionary movement, and knows what missions are for, there is really only a prospectus here: the real work has still to be done. Canon Warren has led us to the borders of the land and has not, we may thankfully state, gone up Pisgah yet: but where is our Joshua?

Dr. Edwin Orr, historian of the 1859 revival, has given us a general study of the nineteenth century in which the missionary movement plays, as one would expect, a large part.[28] Unfortunately, he is mightily cramped for space, which means that, when it comes to missions, he can sometimes do little more than shovel lists of

names at the reader. Bishop Stephen Neill's *Colonialism and Christian Missions* [26] is not confined to the nineteenth century—who ever, indeed, heard of Bishop Neill confining himself to anything?—and, again, provides a brilliant first sketch for a project which needs much more work; and perhaps more attention to Marxist historians than is given here.

It is interesting to compare these works on the modern missionary movement with Professor Greenslade's admirable discussion of pastoral problems in the early centuries,[15] when the Church had no gifts it could bring except the Gospel, and no problems about indigenizing the ministry. In a book which gives one something to think about on almost every page, I was especially stimulated by the closing chapters with their call for a working theology of disunity.

The modern missionary movement did not, of course, except in text books, begin in 1792. There is a direct connexion between Carey and the missionary thinkers, preachers, and activists of North America; and though the first American foreign missionaries did not sail till 1812, American Christians had long been engaged in attempts at evangelization of the non-Christian peoples on their own doorstep. North America was, in fact, the first place where Protestant Christians lived on close terms with a non-Christian people; and through New England goes the unbroken line which links Puritan missionary thought with the world wide movement which came in the wake of the Evangelical Revival. Professor R. Pierce Beaver has done a great service in collecting and carefully editing all the extant ordination sermons (save one) of missionaries to the American Indians down to the time of the first American foreign missionaries, Judson and his party.[11] This gives an invaluable conspectus of the early American missionary movement.

Professor Beaver has done better still in giving us a collection of the writings of Rufus Anderson, the greatest American missiologist and the most dominating single figure in American missionary history. It remains doubtful whether he or Henry Venn first coined the three-self formula, but both ardently desired its implementation. There are curious differences in outworking: for Venn, the three-self formula was not incompatible with the development of a mission-sponsored cotton industry with export facilities, church grammar schools and technical institutes. Anderson, on the other hand, scaled down his mission's institutional involvement, particularly in higher education, on the ground that it squandered resources intended for the propagation of the Gospel. Anderson and Venn are, however, at one in their insistence that the

missionary is an evangelist and trainer of pastors, but must never be a pastor himself. Anderson raises many major issues in missionary policy that are debated today; and I for one am going to use Professor Beaver's selections as a textbook.

In the tradition of Rufus Anderson was Kenneth Strachan of the Latin American Mission, who was responsible for the Evangelism in Depth campaigns which began in Nicaragua in 1960 and have seen remarkable results there and elsewhere. It is good to have an account of these by W. Dayton Roberts[30] which repays thoughtful study. Strachan's contention that evangelization should aim, less at the multiplication of the hearers, than at the fullest participation of the witnesses, i.e. ordinary church members, would have aroused Anderson's enthusiasm, and has its lessons for us all. South America is, of course, by any standards, one of the outstanding areas of Protestant expansion at present; and we have just had our first really scholarly study of this in a doctoral thesis by J. B. A. Kessler, for which time allows no more than an indication of its excellence.[28]

One of the publishing events of the year has been Colin Morris's flamethrower *Include me Out*.[25] I have included him in, although this is only marginally a work about missions as we have delimited them; for the real dynamic of it comes from the fact that he was a missionary. It was a Zambian who died of starvation outside his manse door and who calls forth his denunciation of the Church's misdirected energies. His book is being compared to *Honest to God*, and it is the parts which are most like *Honest to God* which I find most difficult to understand. However, as Mark Twain said about the Bible, it is not the parts I don't understand which disturb me, but the parts I do. And in Morris's passionate plea that Christians should work on the assumption that our Lord really meant what he said about wealth and poverty and hunger and thirst and prison, and his impatient rending of the upholstery with which some of us cushion ourselves against the impact of those words, there sounds again a note which has roused Christians from their comfort in every age since the early Christian centuries. And this passage struck me:

> My grandstand view of the martyrdom of the Church in the Congo counter-revolution taught me to distrust those conventional labels we pin on our fellow Christians. Over three hundred missionaries, mostly Roman Catholics and extreme fundamentalists, were killed. They not only bled the same way but whether they died clutching crucifixes or Schofield Reference Bibles, they died for the same reason and the same Lord.

> When the chips were down in that tragic mess, men and women stood revealed for what they were, their theological labels abandoned with the rest of their possessions. Some theological radicals, fond of booming about *relevance* and *involvement*, were not to be found. Their presence was urgently needed elsewhere. It was often Bible-punching conservatives ... who stood up to be counted. Your theology, fancy or plain, is what you are when the talking stops and the action starts.

But, as Colin Morris must know, you change people even by feeding them. And a modest pamphlet, which few seem to have noticed, by two S.U.M. missionaries, Peter Batchelor, an agriculturalist, and Harry Boer, a theologian, offers a most thoughtful analysis of this in the setting of the cultural mandate of Genesis 1: 28f., and against the background of a traditional African peasant society. There is the germ of a very good book here.[10]

As for the general missionary debate, we have had, of course, Dr. Carl Hallencreutz'[18] important book on the early Kraemer. We have had more contributions to the discussion of 'Anonymous Christianity', with which Fr. Panikkar's name has been much associated; and perhaps the most striking has been from another Roman Catholic, Fr. Eugene Hillman. As his title, *The Wider Ecumenism*[19] suggests, Fr. Hillman is very much a believer in anonymous Christianity; and it is the more striking that, unlike most of the other protagonists who normally have Hinduism or the so-called higher religions in mind, he works in Tanzania, among adherents of the so-called primal religions. This is the kernel of his case: "If grace works for the most part anonymously, and all grace is always and only the same grace, Christ, we may speak of an anonymous Christianity".

Two symposia of real worth stand out. One is the report of this year's Islington Conference, on *Mission in the Modern World*[34] and particularly the papers by Douglas Webster and Philip Crowe. The latter subjects much of the current talk about *diakonia* to searching Scriptural criticism. The other is the excellent discussion by three American conservative evangelicals and three representatives of American ecumenical missionary thinking, with Norman Horner as honest broker, with the title *Protestant Cross-currents in Mission*.[31] A British dialogue along similar lines might have possibilities.

We end our forty-book tour of the world of mission with a book called *The World of Mission*[35] by Professor Bengt Sundkler. It presumably reflects Professor Sundkler's lectures on missiology at Uppsala; it certainly reflects the author's enthusiastic, charismatic and talkative self, as he races from Abraham to the Aga

Khan, from China to Peru. There could be no better indication of the gigantic scope of missionary studies, nor of the demands that will be made on those of us who have set our hands to this particular plough. God speed the plough.

University of Aberdeen

WORKS MENTIONED

[1] AJAYI, J. F. Ade, *Christian missions in Nigeria 1841-1891: the making of a new élite*. London: Longmans, 1965.

[2] AMU, J. W. Omo, *The rise of Christianity in Mid-Western Nigeria*. Yaba: for the author, n.d. [*c.* 1965].

[3] ANDERSON, Gerald H., *Bibliography of the theology of Christian missions in the twentieth century*. New York: Missionary Research Library, 3rd edn., 1966.

[4] ANDERSON, Gerald H., *Christianity in Southeast Asia: a bibliographical guide*. New York: Missionary Research Library, 1966.

[5] (ANDERSON, Rufus), *To advance the gospel. Selections from the writings of Rufus Anderson*. Edited by R. Pierce Beaver. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1967.

[6] AYANDELE, E. A., *The missionary impact on modern Nigeria, 1842-1914: a political and social analysis*. London: Longmans, 1966.

[7] BAËTA, C. G. (ed.), *Christianity in Tropical Africa*. London: O.U.P., 1968.

[8] BARRETT, David B., *Schism and renewal in Africa*. London: O.U.P., 1968.

[9] BARTELS, F. L., *The roots of Ghana Methodism*. Cambridge: C.U.P., 1965.

[10] BATCHELOR, Peter G., and BOER, Harry R., *Theology and Rural Development in Africa*. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1967.

[11] BEAVER, R. Pierce, *Pioneers in Mission*. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1966.

[12] DAVIS, Raymond J., *Fire on the Mountains. The story of a miracle—the Church in Ethiopia*. New York and Toronto: S.I.M., 1966.

[13] DEBRUNNER, Hans W., *A history of Christianity in Ghana*. Accra: Waterville Press, 1967.

[14] GRAHAM, Sonia F., *Government and mission education in Northern Nigeria 1900-1919, with special reference to the work of Hanns Vischer*. Ibadan: Ibadan University Press, 1966.

[15] GREENSLADE, S. L., *Shepherding the flock. Problems of pastoral discipline in the early church and in the younger churches today*. London: S.C.M., 1967.

[16] GRIMLEY, J. B., and ROBINSON, G. E., *Church Growth in Central and Southern Nigeria*. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1966.

[17] HAIR, P. E. H., *The early study of Nigerian languages*. Cambridge: C.U.P., 1968.

[18] HALLENCREUTZ, C. F., *Kraemer towards Tambaram*. Lund: Gleerup, 1966.

[19] HILLMAN, Eugene, *The wider ecumenism: anonymous Christianity and the Church*. London: Burns and Oates, 1968.

[20] HODNE, Olav, *L. O. Skrefsrud, missionary and social reformer among the Santals of Santal Parganas*. Oslo: Forlaget Land og Kirke, 1966.

[21] HORNER, M. A. (ed.), *Protestant cross currents in mission: the ecumenical-conservative encounter.* Nashville: Abingdon Press, 1968.

[22] JULY, Robert W., *The origins of modern African thought.* London: Faber, 1968.

[23] KESSLER, J. B. A., *A study of the older Protestant missions and churches in Peru and Chile, with special reference to the problems of division, nationalism and native ministry.* Goes, Netherlands: Oosterbaan en Le Cointre, 1967.

[24] MITCHELL, R. C., TURNER, H. W., and GRESCHAT, H.-J., *A bibliography of modern African religious movements.* Evanston, Illinois: Northwestern University Press, 1966.

[25] MORRIS, Colin, *Include me out!* London: Epworth, 1968.

[26] NEILL, Stephen, *Colonialism and missions.* London: Lutterworth, 1966.

[27] OOSTHUIZEN, G. C., *The theology of a South African messiah. An analysis of the hymnal of the "Church of the Nazarites".* Leiden: Brill, 1967.

[28] ORR, J. Edwin, *The light of the nations. Progress and achievement in the nineteenth century.* Exeter: Paternoster Press, 1965.

[29] POTTS, E. D., *British Baptist missionaries in India, 1793-1837.* Cambridge: C.U.P.

[30] ROBERTS, W. Dayton, *Revolution in evangelism: the story of Evangelism-in-Depth in Latin America.* Chicago: Moody Press, 1967.

[31] SANGRE, Walter H., *Age, prayer and politics in Tiriki, Kenya.* London: O.U.P., 1966.

[32] SINCLAIR, John H., *Protestantism in Latin America: a bibliographical guide.* Austin, Texas: Hispanic-American Institute, 1967.

[33] SMITH, Noel, *The Presbyterian Church of Ghana, 1835-1960.* London: O.U.P., 1967.

[34] STIBBS, A. M., CROWE, P. A., SHEPPARD, D. S., WEBSTER, D., and JOHNSTON, R. P., *Mission in the modern world. The Islington Conference Papers 1968.* London: Patmos Press, 1968.

[35] SUNDKLER, B. G. M., *The world of mission.* London: Lutterworth, 1965.

[36] TIPPETT, A. R., *Solomon Islands Christianity: a study in growth and obstruction.* London: Lutterworth, 1967.

[37] TURNER, H. W., *African Independent Church.* Oxford: Clarendon Press, 2 vols., 1967.

[38] WARREN, M. A. C., *The missionary movement from Britain in modern history.* London: S.C.M., 1965.

[39] WARREN, M. A. C., *Social History and Christian Mission.* London: S.C.M., 1967.

[40] WEAVER, E. I., and others, *The Abak story.* Uyo, Nigeria: Inter-Church Study Group, 1967.